



KENTUCKY OCCUPATIONAL SAFETY AND HEALTH

JULIAN M. CARROLL GOVERNOR

Walphe

IRIS R. BARRETT Executive Director REVIEW COMMISSION 104 Bridge St. FRANKFORT, KENTUCKY 40601 Phone (502) 564-6892

October 19, 1979

MERLE H STANTON CHAIRMAN

CHARLES B. UPTON

JOHN C. ROBERTS

KOSHRC #583

COMPLAINANT

COMMISSIONER OF LABOR COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

VS.

CHARTER BUILDERS, INC.

DECISION AND ORDER OF REVIEW COMMISSION

Before STANTON, Chairman; UPTON and ROBERTS, Commissioners.

PER CURIAM:

A Recommended Order of Hearing Officer Wayne Waddell, issued under date of July 10, 1979, is presently before this Commission for review, pursuant to a Petition for Discretionary Review filed by the Respondent.

We find that the evidence adequately supports the Hearing Officer's finding that the Respondent was in violation of 29 CFR 1926. 500(b)(1)(as adopted by 803 KAR 2:030) and 29 CFR 1926.500(d)(1)(as adopted by 803 KAR 2:030).

We further find that the penalty reductions recommended by the Hearing Officer were appropriate under the circumstances.

Consistent with our holding in <u>Gateway Erectors</u>, KOSHRC #582, we reject Hearing Officer Waddell's <u>conclusion</u> that a repeat multiplier should not be used in calculating a penalty for a serious violation where the first instance violation was non-serious and carried no penalty.

RESPONDENT

This Commission nevertheless is of the opinion that the record indicates other mitigating circumstances sufficient to justify the recommended reduction in penalty.

Accordingly, it is the unanimous ORDER of this Commission that the Recommended Order of the Hearing Officer be and it is hereby AFFIRMED, except for the legal conclusion of the Hearing Officer hereinabove mentioned, which is hereby OVERRULED. All findings and conclusions of the Hearing Officer not inconsistent with this opinion are hereby AFFIRMED.

Stanton, Chairman

merre n. Stanton, Gharrman

<u>s/Charles B. Upton</u> Charles B. Upton, Commissioner

s/John C. Roberts John C. Roberts, Commissioner

DECISION NO. 772

DATED: October 19. 1979 Frankfort, Kentucky Copy of this Decision and Order has been served by mailing or personal delivery on the following:

Commissioner of Labor (Messenger Service) Commonwealth of Kentucky U. S. 127 South Frankfort, Kentucky 40601 Attention: Hon. Michael D. Ragland Executive Director for Occupational Safety & Health

Hon. Frederick G. Huggins Deputy General Counsel Department of Labor U. S. 127 South Frankfort, Kentucky 40601

Mr. A. D. McMullan, Pres. Charter Builders, Inc. 2525 North Stemmons Freeway, Suite 520 Dallas, Texas 75207

Charter Builders, Inc. 251 East Vine Street Lexington, Kentucky 40507

Hon. Robert C. Elder, Jr. Smith Smith Dunlap & Canterbury 4050 First National Bank Building Dallas, Texas 75202 (Messenger Service)

(Cert. Mail #783431)

(Cert. Mail #783432)

(Cert. Mail #783433)

This 19th day of October, 1979.

Iris R. Barrett Executive Director